

Community Preservation Panel June 5, 2019 Meeting Minutes

The meeting was held at the Aurora Firehouse meeting room at 7:00 pm

Present: Chairperson Chris MacCormick, Jeff Blum, Jim Burkett, and Claire Morehouse

Others Present

Village Officials: Clerk Ann Balloni, Trustee Grace Bates, and Historian Dr. Linda Schwab

Inns of Aurora: Facilities Manager Roger Brown

Members of the Public: Michael T. Bricco, Robin Driskel & John Haggerty, Brian Hamel, Jim Kirkwood, Tracy Leffingwell, Lili MacCormick, Dan Osborn, and John Place

Call to Order: Mr. MacCormick called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

Changes to the Agenda: No changes

Approval of Minutes: On motion by Mr. Blum, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve the May 1, 2019 minutes.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Announcements: Ms. Balloni notified the panel of the Village Planning Board's intent to serve as Lead Agency for Application #19-10 from the Inns of Aurora to convert Taylor House to a conference center. Relief was palpable.

Visitor Welcome: Mr. MacCormick welcomed all visitors and there were no comments.

Old Business

Application #19-04 from Jeff and Jerelyn Martin for a new garage at 46 Sherwood Road (Tax Map #182.09-1-15)

Mr. MacCormick explained that the panel approved repairing the foundation of the garage in March. However, during the renovation project, it was determined that the structure was not stable and an amended application for a new garage was submitted.

Questions arose regarding the color for the garage as being inconsistent with the house, which is white. Several colors were noted on the application and, though Mr. MacCormick acknowledged that color choice is not under the panel's purview, he called the applicant for clarification. Mr. Martin explained that Wedgewood is the dominant color with sandstone doors and a black metal roof. Mr. MacCormick questioned the multi-color motif for the garage given that the house is white, and Mr. Martin explained that, in the future, they would like to re-side the house in keeping with the color scheme of the garage.

On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-04 as amended.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

New Business

Application #19-08 from Robin Driskel and John Haggerty for a new house at 513 Main St (Tax Map #181.08-1-20)

Mr. MacCormick reminded the panel that a demo permit was approved for the existing house in 2015 and the applicants have now submitted plans to build a new house in its place. Mr. MacCormick also noted that the Planning Board approved the project contingent on CPP approval at their May meeting.

Ms. Driskel described a cape cod style house, dark gray with white trim and a black roof, 100' east of the existing structure and ½ story higher. Ms. Driskel explained that, due to the deteriorating foundation, the applicants were advised to move the new house further east.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Burkett, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-08 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-11 from Dan & Katie Osborn for a new shed at 535 Main St (Tax Map #181.08-1-11)

Mr. Osborn described plans for a 12' X 16' X 11' shed with a fence, privacy hedge and raised beds.

On motion by Mr. Blum, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-11 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-12 from United Ministry for a temporary sign at 337 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-24)

Ms. MacCormick described a 3' x 6' dual-side printed banner, posted in the ground, advertising the upcoming Water Ways exhibit from mid-August through mid-September. Ms. MacCormick noted that they would like to use the banner for future events, as well.

On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-12 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-13 from United Ministry for a new sidewalk at 337 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-24)

Ms. Bates described a sidewalk, similar to the chapel sidewalk, extending north from the chapel to the labyrinth.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Burkett, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-13 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-15 from Jim Kirkwood for exterior renovations at 331 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-25)

Mr. MacCormick read a letter of support for the project submitted by Cynthia Koepp & John Place, and a letter from Village Historian, Dr. Linda Schwab, expressing concern regarding the applicant's intent to alter the front façade by replacing a stained glass window and diverting from the Queen Ann style of the house with black, steel railings along the back deck.

The applicant's contractor, Mr. Bricco, described plans to replace windows, replace the north door with a window, replace the back deck and infill the kitchen, and replace the front concrete sidewalk with stamped red brick.

Discussion ensued regarding replacing the leaded, stained glass window on the east side of the house, facing Main St. Mr. Bricco and Mr. Kirkwood explained that they wished to replace the window to save energy, as it rattles in the wind, and to bring more light into the house.

Mr. MacCormick noted that 331 Main St, known as Lyon House, is a contributing structure on the National Historic Register and the CPP is charged with preserving notable architectural features in the village. Dr. Schwab added that original features are integral to the Historic District designation and removing them should only be considered as a last resort.

The Panel, Dr. Schwab and the applicant considered the following:

- Authenticity of the window
- Cost of replacing leaded glass windows
- Homeowners preference
- Village History
- Architectural integrity
- Maintaining historic designation
- Precedent

Mr. Burkett suggested mitigation due to the expense of retaining leaded glass windows. Dr. Schwab recommended options for retaining the window stressing the importance of preserving significant architectural features and noting no undue hardship to the applicant. However, Dr. Schwab requested that, if the window replacement is approved, that the original be saved and stored as part of the Village Historical Archive and an effort made to replace it with a window more in-keeping with the Queen Anne style of the house. Mr. Kirkwood and Mr. Bricco were receptive to Dr. Schwab's suggestion.

The panel also questioned the replacement of the west deck, noting that the black, cable railings with a steel understructure are not reflective of the Queen Anne style. Mr. Bricco explained that they chose black because it blends into the background and is less noticeable. Dr. Schwab deferred to Ms. Morehouse as the Panel color expert and Ms. Morehouse indicated that white was more appropriate. Mr. MacCormick asked if they would consider changing the rail color to white and Mr. Bricco replied that he might paint one of the railings white to see how it will look, but the applicant's preference is black.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-15 as submitted with the following stipulations:

1. Decision of replacement of the leaded glass windows on the east side of the house is deferred pending the applicant's agreeing to submit a replacement window better suited to the style/history of the house.
2. The Panel consulting with the applicant on the color choice of the west deck railings and steel understructure.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Application #19-16 from the Inns of Aurora for new signs at Wallcourt Hall, 38 Lafayette St (Tax Map #181.16-1-7)

Mr. Brown described new black and gold signs to match those of EB Morgan and Rowland House.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Burkett, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-16 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-17 from the Inns of Aurora for a new roof at the Old Schoolhouse, 371 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-17)

Mr. Brown described Eco-Star vinyl, synthetic slate to match the current cedar shake style. Mr. Brown confirmed that work will not begin until after the upcoming Water Ways exhibit, located downstairs in the Aurora History Center.

On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-17 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-18 from the Inns of Aurora for a handrail replacement at the Fargo, 384 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-10)

Mr. Brown described replacing the wooden handrail with rod iron to match the other Inns of Aurora properties.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-18 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-19 from the Inns of Aurora for a new sign at Zabriskie House, 418 Main St (Tax Map #181.12-1-13)

Mr. Brown described a black & gold sign to match the signs on the other guest houses.

On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-19 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Application #19-20 from Jim Kirkwood for a new dock at 331 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-25)

Mr. Bricco explained that the new dock will protect and contain the geothermal pipe. The dock has moisture shield material, a metal frame and no pylons.

On motion by Mr. Blum, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-20 as submitted.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick issued the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Adjournment: On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to adjourn the meeting at 9:15 p.m.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, Morehouse and Murphy

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann Balloni
Village Clerk