

DRAFT

Community Preservation Panel September 4, 2019 Meeting Minutes

The meeting was held at the Aurora Firehouse meeting room at 7:00 pm

Present: Chairperson Chris MacCormick, Jeff Blum, Jim Burkett (7:05), and Claire Morehouse

Others Present

Village Officials: Clerk Ann Balloni, Planning Board member Pat Foser, ZBA member Laura Holland, and Historian Dr. Linda Schwab

Inns of Aurora Representatives: Chief Operating Officer Sue Edinger and Project Manager Ted Kinder

Members of the Public: Ethan Wilson

Call to Order: Mr. MacCormick called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

Changes to the Agenda: Application #19-28 will be reviewed last.

Approval of Minutes: On motion by Mr. Blum, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve the July 11, 2019 minutes.

AYES: Blum, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Announcements: No announcements

Visitor Welcome: Dr. Schwab noted that she sent copies of preservation briefs from the Department of the Interior to the clerk for inclusion in tonight's meeting packets. The briefs contain guidelines on interior changes to historic buildings as well as exterior additions.

Old Business

Application #17-43 from the Inns of Aurora to amend the Zabriskie House site plan to include a fence (Tax Map #181.12-1-13)

Mr. Kinder described a 4x4 fence, 37' long and 4' tall along the west side of the parking lot to deflect headlight glare onto the patio from cars pulling into the parking lot. The fence is similar to the 6x6 fence on the property along Court St and the 12x12 fence at Wallcourt, though a finer grain material is proposed. The fence will have gabled tops with 8' spacing and three additional dogwood trees will be planted between the fence and the patio.

Mr. MacCormick questioned the (lack of?) metal tops on the Wallcourt fence and Mr. Kinder replied that he will review.

On motion by Mr. Burkett, seconded by Ms. Morehouse, the CPP voted to approve the fence, as amended on the site plan for Application #17-43.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. MacCormick noted the approval on the application flowchart.

New Business

Application #19-10 from the Inns of Aurora to convert Taylor House to a conference center at 396 Main St (Tax Map #181.16-1-7.1) – Consultation

The Inns of Aurora are working with the Board of Trustees to amend the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) signed in April 2019. The MOU allowed the Inns of Aurora to convert Taylor House to a conference center as the catalyst for a Generic Environmental Impact Statement (GEIS) of all their properties. The Inns of Aurora have requested a decoupling of the Taylor House Project from the GEIS to move the project forward immediately and submit a different project to initiate the GEIS process.

Mr. MacCormick acknowledged the CPP as an involved agency for the State Environmental Quality Review (SEQR), with the Planning Board serving as the lead agency.

Ms. Edinger and Mr. Kinder re-introduced the project to the CPP with plans including:

- Maximum of 50 attendees
- 18 space parking lot with cedar fence for screening
- Expansion of pedestrian walkways to Taylor House and Main St
- Expansion of the south patio, change from concrete to blue stone
- Minimal changes to the first floor beyond code/ADA requirements
- 1 large conference room on the 2nd floor with additional break out rooms for smaller gatherings
- Installation of ADA bathroom and elevator
- Replacement windows
- Return of the garden house
- Revised drainage plan to include an innovative system of basins under the parking lot with attached pipes leading to lawn sprinklers

The panel briefly discussed the replacement windows with Mr. Kinder noting that the current windows are not original to the house, confirmed by a late 19th century photo, and that they will be replaced in kind with energy efficient windows.

Mr. MacCormick also noted that the CPP will defer the siting of the garden house to the Planning Board as part of their Site Plan Review.

Mr. Kinder confirmed that ingress and egress to and from the new parking lot is accessed via Court St. and includes a 3' retaining wall on the south side. Mr. MacCormick questioned if any buffer/screening is planned between the parking lot and the residential home on the corner of Court St and Cherry Ave. Mr. Kinder replied that they are incorporating a fence like the one that was located on the north side of Rowland House and retaining the existing hedgerow.

Mr. MacCormick noted that the CPP purview over the project is limited to the replacement windows, the garden house, the patio and the parking lot, and confirmed that no determinations may be issued until the amended MOU with the Board of Trustees is signed.

Dr. Schwab expressed concern over the renovations to the second floor due to the removal of two bearing walls and the removal of notable plaster and moldings. Dr. Schwab explained that the interior renovation requires CPP review as well,

given that the house is changing from residential to commercial and commercial properties are considered public ways. Mr. MacCormick questioned Dr. Schwab's reasoning, remarking that the panel has not dealt with interior changes in the past, and expressed concern with setting precedent. Dr. Schwab referred to section 707 of the Village Zoning Law, citing that the CPP is charged with following the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for their reviews. The guidelines include structures, property setting and change of use for historic buildings.

Mr. Burkett suggested recreating a drop-down beam and reusing the plaster and moldings around it as a means of mitigation. Ms. Edinger and Mr. Kinder indicated that Mr. Burkett's idea was plausible. Dr. Schwab suggested using the molding to outline the depth of the ceiling.

Mr. MacCormick reiterated that tonight is merely a consultation with the applicants and that he would like to discuss the interior issue with Dr. Schwab and Mayor Bennett before the next CPP meeting.

Application #19-29 from Lisa Ryerson to construct a new porch at 280 Main St (Tax Map #182.17-1-22) - Consultation

Mr. MacCormick and Dr. Schwab discussed the historic background of the home, built in 1810 and the boyhood home of Lewis Henry Morgan, son of Jedediah Morgan. Ms. Morehouse added that the south portion of the house was added between World War I and World War II and was initially a tearoom.

Dr. Schwab noted that the building is one of the most historic buildings in the village given that Lewis Henry Morgan was regarded internationally for his work as a social theorist. Dr. Schwab expressed concern over the proposed porch due to the extensive size encompassing the entire front of the structure and having no relation to the Federal Style of the original house. Dr. Schwab added that the proposed porch will obscure the historic features of the original section of the house.

Mr. MacCormick responded that there have been sections added through the years to the original structure, perhaps as many as five, and many houses in the village have porches that are not original to the building.

Mr. Burkett and Ms. Morehouse questioned the size of the porch, 951 square feet, compared with the square footage of the original house. Mr. Zwigard answered "1200 square feet". Ms. Morehouse echoed Dr. Schwab's opinion that the porch is not in keeping with the Federal style of the house.

Mr. MacCormick remarked that the historic aspect of the house could be preserved while adding a porch and Ms. Morehouse agreed, but not with the proposed porch.

Mr. Blum suggested a porch like the McGuire's, but Dr. Schwab noted that that house is a different era.

Dr. Schwab referred the panel to the Secretary of Interior's Guidelines on Exterior Additions to Historic Homes included in their meeting packet and advised reviewing them within the context of section 707 of the Village Zoning Law.

Mr. Zwigard explained that the property owners are interested in a porch like their neighbors to the south (Peter Fort house), one that is usable and facing west for the lake views. The materials he plans to use are a high-tech synthetic material that will be painted white to match the house and matching roof shingles as well.

Mr. MacCormick recommended that Mr. Zwigard relay the panel/historian's concerns to the property owner and gave Mr. Zwigard a copy of the Secretary of Interior's Guidelines on Exterior Additions to Historic Homes to discuss with them.

Application #19-28 from Ethan Wilson to construct a new fence at 28 Cherry Ave (Tax Map #182.13-1-17.1)

Mr. Wilson described a chain-link fence on the east side of the property and adding on to an existing picket fence on the west side of the property. The fence is for keeping a family dog enclosed in the back yard.

Mr. MacCormick questioned how the neighbors on the chain-link side felt about the fence. Mr. Wilson replied that he convinced them that the fence would be unobtrusive. Ms. Balloni added that the neighbors requested a copy of the application be emailed to them as they are currently out of town and could not attend tonight's meeting. The application, including pictures, was emailed on August 29 and no comment was received.

Mr. MacCormick expressed some aesthetic concerns with the chain-link fence, though noted that it is nicer looking than most and is not very visible to the public way. Mr. MacCormick and Ms. Morehouse asked Mr. Wilson if he considered an "invisible" deer fence, similar to others in the village, that are much less noticeable. Mr. Wilson indicated that he would consider it.

On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Blum, the CPP voted to approve Application #19-28 as submitted, with approval for the chain-link fence proposed or an invisible fence.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Adjournment: On motion by Ms. Morehouse, seconded by Mr. Burkett, the CPP voted to adjourn the meeting at 8:40 p.m.

AYES: Blum, Burkett, MacCormick, and Morehouse

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann Balloni
Village Clerk